Urban Shield Task Force  
Friday, September 22, 2017  
9:00 a.m.

Dr. Muntu Davis, Chair  

Location: Alameda County Training and Conference Center  
125 ~ 12th Street, 4th Floor  
Oakland Room  
Oakland, CA 94612

Summary Minutes

I. Call to Order/Welcome

Muntu Davis, MD, Department of Public Health, Chair, called the meeting to order.

Roll call

Jim Betts, Surgeon-in-Chief, Asst. Director, Trauma Services, Children’s Hospital Oakland  
Marla Blagg, BART Police  
Mike Grant, Owner, Guns Unlimited Training Center  
Lara Kiswani, Executive Director, Arab Resource and Organizing Center  
Tash Nguyen, advocate  
Cheryl Miraglia, Castro Valley resident, District 4  
John Lindsay Poland, American Friends Service Committee, District 5  
Muntu Davis, Alameda County Health Officer, Chair, Urban Shield Task Force  
Ray Lara, Alameda County, County Counsel  
Brett Keteles, Assistant Sheriff, Alameda County Sheriff’s Office  
Omowale Satterwhite, Facilitator  
Kathleen Harris, Facilitator  
Dan Bellino, Chief of Staff, Alameda County Office of Education  
Carol Burton, Supervisor Keith Carson’s Office, District 5  
Anne Kronenberg, Director, SF Department of Emergency Management  
Glenn Katon, Katon Law  
David Winnacker, Alameda County Fire Department  
Travis Kusman, Alameda County Emergency Medical Services  
Susan Abdullah, pediatric

II. Approval of Minutes: August 25, 2017

A motion was made and seconded by that the minutes of August 25, 2017, be approved with the following corrections/amendments:

Correct spelling of David Winnacker, Alameda County Fire Department, Anne Kronenberg, to record the number of ayes and nayes on each vote.

Motion passed: Ayes: 11; Abstain: 3
Lara Kiswani made a motion to record in the minutes the way each task member voted seconded by John Lindsay Poland.

Motion passed
Ayes: Lara Kiswani, Jon Lindsay Poland, Tash Nguyen, Glenn Katon, Susan Abdullah, Anne Kronenberg, Dan Bellino, Travis Kusman

Noes: Cheryl Miraglia, Marla Blagg, Mike Grant, Brett Keteles, Dan Winnacker

III. Discussion of Recommendations Learning Question 4

Learning Questions 4: Do the terms, conditions and guidelines of this program meet the demand for the Bay Area Region to be prepared to respond to natural disaster (fire, earthquake, etc.) or a terrorist attack?

Draft Response: The Task Force was unable to come to agreement on this question in relationship to Urban Shield. It remains unclear:
1) How the assessment of the risk relevance, level of capability and gap level is determined and
2) How the Regional Threat Hazard Identifications and Risk Assessment (THIRA) is applied when selecting and drafting exercise scenarios, prioritizing capability targets, and gaps and selecting capabilities to be tested and gaps to be addressed each year and over multiple years.

Bay Area UASI’s Risk Relevance rating show core capabilities such as “Health and Human Services”, “Economic and Community Recovery”, “Long-Term Vulnerability Reduction”, Housing”, “Public Health and Medical Services”, and “Natural and Cultural Resources” ALL as having low risk relevance, while “Cyber Security”, “On-Scene Security and Protection”, and “Screening, Search and Detection”, are rated as having the highest risk relevance.

The Task Force was in agreement that more could be done to meet the demand for whole community preparedness. Urban Shield has included a component for community preparedness. This component is separate from the full-scale exercise activities with first responders and emergency personnel.

Motion was made by Marla Blagg and seconded to accept the draft response.

Motion passed: Unanimous

Draft Recommendation:

4a. Training and exercise should focus emergency preparedness efforts on prevention of and recovery from emergencies as much as or more than response to such emergencies.

4b. In addition to risks to people, ensure, especially those who are vulnerable to harm in emergencies, in Alameda County who are more highly considered not only risks to non-human assets.

4c. Increase funding for the Urban Shield exercise to incorporate additional preparedness activities to support FEMA’s “whole community” inclusion approach. By doing so, the County will be better prepared and more resilient.
Jon Lindsay Poland made a motion, seconded by Tash Nguyen to add to the draft recommendation for Learning Question 4: Proposal for study: The Obama and Trump administrations sought steep cuts in USAI grant funds for FY 2017 and FY 2018, respectively. The Trump administration has stated that it will cut federal funds to sanctuary jurisdictions, which may include several within BAUSI area. The Alameda County Board of Supervisors shall send a request to jurisdictions within the BAUSI 12-county area to identify non-UASI grants and/or funds from their own resources for disaster preparedness, in order to replace dependence on UASI funds. In addition, the Board will survey the below-named jurisdictions that have not participated in Urban Shield for a number of years, requesting the following information:

a) Why have you not participated in Urban Shield? What has the effect been, if any?
b) What programs have been implemented to address preparedness for critical emergencies?
c) How have community-based programs responded or grown since the city stopped participating in Urban Shield?
d) Who participates in them (name departments)? Do community members or civilians participate?
e) What are the contents of the trainings, and who runs them?
f) What do these trainings emphasize? (ex. natural disaster, mass casualty, terrorist attack, etc.)
g) What are the stated objectives of these trainings?
h) How do these trainings facilitate relationships between emergency workers and the community?
i) What is the number of professional development days?
j) Do you receive training in projects for recovery from critical emergencies?
k) How do you meet your budget for these trainings? Through city or county?
l) What is the general procedure for responding to mass casualty events? (Who responds)
m) (For emergency services) Do you have trainings or events coming up that are open to the public?

The Alameda County Sheriff’s Office shall verify which law enforcement tactical teams of the following jurisdictions did not participate in Urban Shield for three or more of the last ten years or did not apply to participate in 2016: Menlo Park PD; Palo Alto PD; Mountain View PD; Santa Clara County Sheriff; Vallejo PD; Santa Cruz PD; Watsonville PD; Pacifica PD; Napa County city PDs; Sonoma County city PDs; Marin County city PDs; except Novato.

Speaker
Cindy Shamban supports the recommendation proposed to be added to Learning Question 4 regarding assessing non-participating jurisdictions.

Motion passed.
Ayes: Susan Abdullah, Lara Kiswani, Tash Nguyen, Jon Lindsay Poland, Glenn Katon, Dave Winnacker, Jim Betts, Dan Bellino, Travis Kusman, Anne Kronenberg, Brett Keteles, Marla Blagg

Noes: Cheryl Miraglia, Mike Grant

Cheryl Miraglia made a motion seconded by Marla Blagg to accept recommendation 4a as amended: Training and exercises should also focus emergency preparedness efforts on prevention of and recovery from emergencies in addition to response to such emergencies.

Speaker
Laura Magnani stated that training should be about prevention, not response.
**IV. Discussion of Recommendations Learning Question 5**

**Learning Questions 5:** What is the impact of Urban Shield on the community’s relationship with law enforcement and other emergency preparedness responders such as the public health department; health care agencies, public education agencies, public transportation agencies, fire departments and emergency medical services?
Draft Response: There are two different views among Task Force members:

**Negative**
- Impacted communities have mistrust
- There is a perception of militarized response by these agencies
- They are seen as one in the same

**Positive**
- Safer communities
- Higher collaborations of 1st responders
- Greater confidence in our ability to respond to mass casualty incident
- Better relationship between law partners and volunteers
- Community is better prepared

Lara Kiswani made a motion seconded by Jon Lindsay Poland to suspend discussion on Learning Question 5 and not vote on the draft response or draft recommendations, given that the Urban Shield Task Force does not represent vulnerable communities or those impacted, and that this is not the right body to make recommendations to the Board of Supervisors about community impact of Urban Shield.

**Speakers**

Mickey Duxbury, Hussain Falah, Jade Sullivan, Reverend Terry de Grace-Morris, Itsan, Woods Erman, Lily Haskell, Mohamed, Charlene Khoo, Laura Magnani, Eleanor Levine, Dawn Haney, Kasi Chakravartula, Vanessa Riles, Jay Salazar, Carrie Schiff, Jean Jefferess, LiZhen Wang, Cecilia Luces, Dylan Cooke, Nichola Torbett, Carol Robison, Marcia Lovelace, Max Airborne, Lacey Hunter, Sharon Fenneman, Susie Kisder, and Katie Loncke all spoke in opposition to Urban Shield and talked about negative impacts on vulnerable communities.

Stop Urban Shield members sang a song to oppose Urban Shield.

**Motion passed.**

**Ayes:** Lara Kiswani, Jon Lindsay Poland, Tash Nguyen, Susan Abdullah, Glenn Katon, Dave Winnacker, Travis Kusman, Anne Kronenberg

**Noes:** Cheryl Miraglia, Marla Blagg, Mike Grant

**Abstain:** Dan Bellino, Bret Keteles, Jim, Betts

**V. Summary of Board of Supervisors Recommendations**

Dr. Muntu Davis, written report submitted with all recommendations including the master list of recommendations. Trying to determine a date and will work with Supervisor Carson’s office. Will notify by e-mail. Will have an opportunity to see it before it goes to the Board of Supervisors.

Questions or concerns about the report can referred to Dr. Davis

Jon Lindsay Poland made a motion and seconded by that the report to the Board of Supervisors include a summary of substantive points made in the last two meetings of Task Force.

**Motion failed.**

**Ayes:** N/A
Noes: Cheryl Miraglia Glenn Katon, Dave Winnacker, Jim Betts, Dan Bellino, Travis Kusman, Anne Kronenberg, Brett Keteles, Marla Blagg

Abstain: Susan Abdullah, Lara Kiswani, Tash Nguyen, Jon Lindsay Poland,

VI. Next Steps and Acknowledgements

Dr. Davis thanked the Task Force for their work, the facilitators Omowale Satterwhite and Kathleen Harris and the Clerk of the Board staff.

Carol Burton thanked all who participated on the Task Force and Dr. Muntu Davis for chairing the Task Force.

VII. Public Comment

None.

VIII. Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 12:05 p.m.